

Boston Symphony Orchestra Chicago Symphony Orchestra The Cleveland Orchestra Los Angeles Philharmonic

New York Philharmonic The Philadelphia Orchestra San Francisco Symphony The League of American Orchestras

## TALKING ABOUT COMMUNITY

Spotlight Conversation #1 Transcript

Brent Assink, Executive Director, San Francisco Symphony Mark Clague, Professor of Music, University of Michigan Neil Harris, Professor Emeritus of History/Art History, University of Chicago Jesse Rosen, President/CEO, League of American Orchestras

> **October 23, 2011** Davies Symphony Hall, San Francisco

The American Orchestra Forum is a project of the San Francisco Symphony, generously supported by a grant from The Andrew W. Mellon Foundation.

© 2011 San Francisco Symphony. All rights reserved.

[Beginning of recorded material.]

Brent Assink: Good afternoon, and welcome. I need to confess to you that we actually prayed for snow today and got sunshine instead, and I really want to thank you all, especially, for being here, given how rare these sunny days are in San Francisco, as we all know. So we're really glad to see you. I'm Brent Assink, executive director of the San Francisco Symphony, and we're delighted to welcome you to our first American Orchestra Forum event, which is talking about community. And today's forum is really going to explore the many ways in which orchestras connect with their communities as music makers, of course, which we all know about, but also as educators, as civic partners, as architectural touchstones, and as community builders.

> So, in terms of how today will work, we will begin with two spotlight conversations, which are intended to give some in-depth thinking from small groupings of our speakers. Then at around 3 o'clock we'll have a break and come back with a roundtable discussion with all of the spotlight speakers so that they have a chance to respond to each other and take the conversation a bit further. You'll also have an opportunity to ask questions at that point. Then, following another break at 4:15, we'll welcome Maestro Dudamel and Los Angeles Philharmonic president and CEO Debra Borda to bring their special perspective on community connections. All of today's proceedings are being recorded and will be available on the project website, symphonyforum.org.

The website is also home to ongoing blogging on these topics, and we invite you to share your comments on the site. We're live blogging today, so you can make your comments at any time. If you're using Twitter, you can follow the conversation through the American Orchestra Forum Twitter feed, which is @amorchforum or obviously A-M-O-R-C-H-F-O-R-U-M, or you can use the #amorchforum. And in consideration of our panelists today and our recording we do ask that you please silence your devices during the event. Photography is permitted, but no flashes or tripods, please. And since this is not a concert you should feel free to come and go as you wish.

There are refreshments in the lobby and restrooms on the lower level. And we are also pleased to acknowledge, with great gratitude, the sponsorship of the Andrew W. Mellon foundation that is making this project possible. So, again, welcome, we're glad you're here. Please engage in conversation. Please stump our panelists with tough questions and tough comments. We're really looking forward to a robust and in-depth discussion today on the place of American orchestras in our communities. So please join me in welcoming our first spotlight speakers today, led by Professor Mark Clague from the University of Michigan. Thank you.

Mark Clague: Thank you. Welcome. It's great to see everybody here. As Brent mentioned, we'll be talking about community. I'm Professor Mark Clague from the University of Michigan, where I work with the American Music Institute and teach on both American culture and musicology. And about, well, a year and a half ago we had a meeting in Ann Arbor about the future of the American orchestra, and San Francisco was a great partner. And Susan Key came out and joined us there. And, actually, the orchestra will be coming and visiting Ann Arbor as part of their Mavericks festival in March. And so we'll be having a fourth conversation in Ann Arbor.

So I'm just really thrilled to be part of this and thank everyone so much for being here. It's great to see you. It's great to have the community here to talk about community. And we do hope that you'll participate in the discussion with your questions and observations in our second half. But we wanted to start off and just get some thoughts from our panel, and I'm welcoming Professor Neil Harris from the University of Chicago, where actually I did my undergrad, so it's great to see you again, Neil, and Jesse Rosen, who's the president and CEO of the League of American Orchestras.

So what's exciting to me about this panel is we have sort of basically both ends of the spectrum chronologically, with Neil, who's a scholar sort of looking at the history of art in America, and he had appointments in history but also in art history at the university, and looked at the role of the artist in America. So one of his really exciting and sort of pioneering books is *The Artist in American Society*. Jesse, on the other hand, is working very much with the contemporary scene, working with orchestras today about some of the new, innovative ideas about sort of changing the relationships of orchestras not just as a symbol of community but actually as a community partner, really being involved in the life of its neighborhood.

And so I think that's one of the exciting things about this panel is sort of just to look at this issue of community from these two perspectives. So I thought we'd start off maybe with a question for you, Neil, just about sort of historically how does this relationship between the community and the orchestra come together? I mean, today, when you think of an orchestra, it's always the city name orchestra -- San Francisco Symphony, New York Philharmonic, Philadelphia Orchestra, the place and the ensemble -- you can't have one without the other. So how did that happen?

Neil Harris: Well, I think a lot of our history, culturally and politically, is local history. It's really what communities make of themselves. And it's interesting to note, as we're celebrating this wonderful centennial, that many American orchestras were founded in a 20- or 30-year period, just really the decades proceeding 1911 and just afterward. And I think the role of the community there is, in effect, to credential it by the founders of the orchestra. What does a real city need to have in order to make claims that it is a real city? And one of the things at the turn of the century, for many places, was an orchestra.

There were also, of course, public libraries, universities, art museums, science museums, a whole constellation of institutions usually bearing the city's name and created, in part, by philanthropists who were in some cases assuming the corporate identity of the city but who wanted both to pay back the community for their success and also to place the community, San Francisco in this case, on the world map. After all, before the airplane, cities in California, at least, were a far distance from other metropolitan areas. So I think this was a sense of connecting to the worldwide network of cities, which had some pretensions about themselves.

Mark Clague:It's interesting how much the founding of orchestras actually<br/>follows periods of real civic crisis. I mean, I think in Chicago with<br/>the Great Chicago Fire, but here with the earthquake in 1906.

Neil Harris: Yes, correct.

Mark Clague: And, in many ways, the founding of the orchestra is an announcement to the world that we're back, you know, we have a community here that's ready to welcome you and that's civilized.

Neil Harris: Both Chicago and San Francisco are phoenix cities. I think they claim to have risen from their ashes. In San Francisco's case, of course, it was planning for the great 1915 Exposition, the Panama Pacific. That was one of the impelling factors in creating the orchestra. In Chicago's case, it was the Great Columbian Exposition of 1893, which was followed, of course, a year later by the midwinter exposition in Golden Gate Park. And I should mention, by the way, that parks are a part of this larger institutional outreach.

Creating a park system was also considered one of the functions of enlightened city leadership.

- Mark Clague: So, Jesse, do you think this connection between sort of the community and its community health, the thriving nature of the population, is that still true today? Is that part of why we have orchestras? Or what are the sort of contemporary trends in this relationship between an orchestra and its community?
- Jesse Rosen: Well, I'm not an historian, although every morning I look in the mirror and I see my hair get grayer and grayer and more of it falling out. I fear I most be old enough to have some perspective on something. And, you know, just think of Neil's comments and adversity in the beginnings of orchestras. You know, the 1930s were a tremendous period for orchestras, surprisingly enough, under the WPA, the Works Progress Administration. I believe 11 orchestras were either founded or restarted in the WPA program. And then also, mentioning Chicago, the Grant Park Symphony, which today is still a very vital, vibrant organization, was the first orchestra funded out of a Parks District in its entirety.

The entire \$2 million allocation came out of the Park District for free concerts, and it was started by the Parks District and the American Federation of Musicians. So, even going back in time, there was a sense of symphony orchestras serving a wider public and having a social role. And I think if you skip ahead now to the --let's say after the Second World War and moving into the 1950s, really '60s, I think what we began to see happen was that, throughout the United States, there was, I think you could say, a movement to institutionalize the performing arts and to raise professional standards, to elevate the performing artist as a legitimate citizen who was entitled to a living wage and a season of music making.

And so tremendous resources went into building our institutions -orchestra companies, theatre companies, dance companies -supported by corporate support, foundation support, government support. I think it was part of the national agenda, frankly, and I think during that phase the American orchestra built up a system of practices that were intended to professionalize the experience, raise the artistic standard, improvement living conditions for American musicians, and our focus during this period was on the excellence in quality of the performance.

And this was, I think, really the galvanizing idea about American orchestras for a very long time. And, meanwhile, the world was changing, and our country was changing in terms of who lived in it, who lived in the neighborhoods our concert halls were in, who was populating our country, and what our sensibilities were about what it meant to be a nonprofit organization in contemporary America. And I think with that change we've seen a widespread shift in how orchestra resources and roles are being deployed now in their communities. Mark Clague: Well, that's a great point, just that orchestras in the United States, at least, are nonprofit organizations, which means they're granted special tax status, but because they are also serving a community. San Francisco Symphony, you know, maintains a youth orchestra, they have the Keeping Score program, we're doing public programs like this today, so they're serving the community with a kind of -- a spiritual performance. I mean, the sort of musical sustenance, the way in which that feeds our souls, but there's also a very practical approach to providing services to the community. Is what's happening here at San Francisco -- is that unusual or is that happening a lot of different places in the country? Or what do you see as the ways in which orchestras serve their community?

Jesse Rosen: You know, one piece of context to answer the question -- there are about 1,800 orchestras in the United States. They are attended by about 25 million people every year. And about 90 percent of those orchestras have budgets under \$5 million, not at all like the San Francisco Symphony, and in many of those orchestras you find a kind of community integration that is just natural in those towns and cities. I was at a board meeting in a small town in Michigan, I can't even remember the name, I'm embarrassed to say, but at the board meeting -- I'll just try to tell this fast -- but everyone was introducing themselves.

> So one woman says, well, I came on the board -- I'm a cook, and I run a restaurant, and somebody once said to me that my business would do much better if I had some music. So I started looking for a

musician, and I found a bass player. And so the bass player would come to my restaurant and he'd play, and it worked. And more people came to the restaurant. And then I was talking to the bass player one day and he said, you know, by the way, I play in the orchestra, too, you should come hear the orchestra. So, I really wasn't interested in the orchestra, but I liked the bass player, so I went to go hear the concert. And so I became a subscriber, I really like the orchestra. And it got to the next person to introduce themselves, and it was the bass player.

So, I mean, there's something about the smaller scale of these hundreds and hundreds of orchestras that make them somehow easily woven into the fabrics of their communities. Our larger orchestras, which play really on an international stage, I think are -in some ways were challenged to maintain both international orchestratic standards, touring schedules, and a lot of resource into core subscription activity, while, at the same time, developing meaningful work in their communities.

And, in that regard, the San Francisco symphony is certainly among one of the leaders in the country, and the dimensions across which orchestras are engaging with community -- San Francisco -- one of their new programs -- I don't even know -- I hope I'm not saying something that's not announced yet, but there's a plan for an amateur symphony orchestra. And one of the community changes that we know is happening -- we know this from the government's recent report on arts participation -- there's actually an increase in amateur performance of classical music in the home.

So we're seeing a number of orchestras wanting to tap into that. This is not about marketing and audience development. It's about serving a part of their communities. Large numbers of programs involved in wellness. We see orchestras involved with senior communities. The Philadelphia Orchestra has a closed-circuit stream of their concerts at the senior citizen centers around Philadelphia. And I would say, also, I think it needs to be said that even from the creative standpoint, what happens on the stage in the main concerts, themselves, as our repertoire grows and unfolds, it also is beginning to reflect immigrant populations.

And so there have been generations of composers in the last 20 or 30 years coming into the United States, very distinctive sense of how the orchestra can be utilized to expand the sound palette. And those composers, often, when their works are done, often they're done in partnership with local neighborhood organizations because of natural tie-ins. And so the main stage work of orchestras also I think is becoming more community-focused than it used to be.

Mark Clague: I want to pick up on that theme of amateurism and turn back to you, Neil. I mean, one of the things that the San Francisco Symphony has done over the years, I mean, [you know, pioneering] the radio industry and recording with Moniteau and, you know, just using electronics and blogging and video online -- to be able to share the work of one orchestra with many, many different people. But what that also did was sort of distance itself from the everyday musician in the home. I mean, in the 19th century, you don't have radio, you don't have recording. If you're going to have music in the home, you're going to have to make it yourself. And so there's a different relationship between the community and the specialist musician, maybe a closer relationship? Can you talk of that?

Neil Harris: Well, there was a lot more live music, I think, available wherever you went in most countries. In the United States, there were hotel orchestras, there were restaurant orchestras, café orchestras. You couldn't put them into your ear and carry them around with you in the way that you can now, but you had music everywhere. And, in a paradoxical way, this stimulated some of the early orchestra founders who were concerned about the quality of music being heard and who reacted, in some ways, indignantly at what they saw was the cheapening of musical taste. And the orchestra was created by, some of its founders, like Theodore Thomas, for example, to establish a certain quality standard. And I think this is what you were really talking about, this shift from one focus to another.

There are a few people sort of in the middle -- we both share an interest in John Philip Sousa, for example, the great band conductor and composer -- whose concerts included both opera and symphonic music. Most Americans before 1910 would've heard their first orchestral compositions on a band, probably, because bands were widespread, not only Sousa's. But Sousa would put in

Verdi and Beethoven and then the latest show tunes, perhaps an occasional hymn and maybe some popular ditties, and for this he was roundly criticized by some who felt that music should be segregated and segmented into different audiences. So this tension, I think, has been around for a long time in our culture.

- Mark Clague: Yeah, one of the great sort of tidbits of history is that the American premiere of Percival, Wagner's opera, was actually done by the Sousa band, not by the Met, so Sousa was very much involved with elevating taste and sharing good music. And the phrase good music became sort of synonymous with classical music, and that's been part of the struggle with the orchestra. I mean, you have these beautiful halls and these incredibly talented musicians with hours and hours of training, and there's at least a danger that people will feel that that's something sort of high class, that it's not for everyone.
- Neil Harris: There's a danger, but there also was, I think, something achieved.
  The campaigns to erect these buildings, which continue to go on in
  America as new centers are created, new arts centers, new concert
  halls, identify people and bring them together in a common cause.
  And the campaigns, such as I presume the centennial campaign for
  this orchestra, are also ways for the community to identify
  themselves as supporters and to announce that they are stakeholders
  in the fate of the institution. Museums do this. A whole range of
  American nonprofits.

And I think it's a cultural trait that's very distinctive, and it's been fundamental, really, in the success of these organizations, and that will be fundamental to their future success. So these halls, although they, in some cases, are expensive and intimidating and centralizing, also serve the purpose of organizing the leadership, which can move on to other things once their immediate goals have been accomplished.

Mark Clague: It's an interesting phenomena that, you know, from the sense that I have of history, growing up, I mean, the computer age sort of hit while I was a kid and starting with the Apple II plus and other -you know, all with 48k of RAM. It was very exciting in the 1980s. But just to watch the way the computer screen has become this window on to the world for us, and it's [mediating] us -- I mean, we can watch any symphonic piece on YouTube, right? But, at the same time, you know, is that a threat to the live orchestra? But it also really highlights the special nature of coming together, of being with your family, being with your friends, being with your neighbors at a live event.

> And I also, in a strange way, I think that the ubiquity of sort of the iPod and the sound quality of those media players, which is actually quite poor, makes live music -- makes the real thing even more vivid, you know, more exciting. The Verdi last night that was here, the Requiem Mass, what an incredible sound, and you just can't get that out of a set of headphones, at least not [little] ear buds, you know? So, Jesse, do you think that these changes in technology --

how is that changing our relationship to community and our relationship to our listeners?

Jesse Rosen: Well, you know, one thing that comes to mind, a very vivid example, and it does have to do with the buildings that orchestras play in -- the new hall in Miami that Frank Gary designed for the new World Symphony is a hall that's designed to, on the one hand --I don't know how to say this -- it has walls, but the purpose of the walls is to be transparent. And so half of the façade of the building is all class, so you can see straight in -- you can see straight into the practice rooms, into administrative offices -- the other half of the façade of the building is a wall upon which they broadcast, you know, their live concerts.

> And so they have an interesting phenomenon going on where, actually, when they give concerts now, sometimes there are more people -- people will go in to watch the live concert at the beginning, but then they'll go out so they can experience it from the outside, as well. So people are -- you know, the definition of what's live and what's not live is changing somewhat because of the -- you know, with technology, is --

Neil Harris: Sort of like football stadium, after all, have screens.

Jesse Rosen: That's right.

Neil Harris:And you watch the game, and sometimes you watch the screeninstead of the game.

Mark Clague: But with the YouTube Symphony Orchestra that Michael Tilson Thomas was conducting, where are there 33 million people watching that, and I know -- I was one of those people who got up in the middle of the night so that I could watch the event on my computer screen live, right? And my friends were, like, well, why didn't you just sleep in and then you -- because you can watch it any time, right? I mean, why -- but there was something about feeling that you were part of this sort of global energy that transforms it.

> And that's -- I think that brings up another interesting topic, which is, you know, when we talk about music and the communities we talk about, like economic development, we talk about the ways in which it brings, you know, prestige to our communities, but there's also something magical about music, that spiritual demand. And, Neil, can you talk a little bit about -- I mean, what were the founders of these institutions that you talked about -- what were they really interested -- were they interested in that spiritual dimension, do you think, or what did music provide for its community?

Neil Harris: Well, I think many -- of course, the founders varied, and generalizing is -- I speak now as an Emeritus professor -- no generalization -- Mark Clague: You're allowed to generalize now. Once you become Emeritus --

Neil Harris: I'm retired. I can say whatever I want. When you get people like -- I mean, the founder of the American symphony orchestras often considered -- [that is the lay] founder -- Henry Lee Higginson of Boston and the Boston Symphony, which was created in the 1880s, is a model that many orchestras followed. He certainly had what he conceived of as a transcendent mission, to bring great music and a great orchestra to the people. And there was a missionary aspect to this that was very powerful. It was present in Chicago with Charles Fay, who was, again, a masonist behind that orchestra. And it was present with Theodore Thomas -- I was just reading about Thomas this past week.

He told a friend of his who began to tell him an off-color story that he was very upset because, whenever he saw his face in the audience when he was conducting, he might be reminded of that story and his relationship to the music would be affected --

Mark Clague: It pollutes his music --

Neil Harris: Would be polluted. And this kind of high-minded sense of mission was, I think, present in the early backers and founders of the orchestra. Sometimes to great merit, and sometimes to great cost.

Mark Clague:Now, Jesse, that's sort of a hard argument to make maybe to<br/>politicians or to public policy, and, you know, I think that economic

argument, you know, especially now with the need for jobs and things, is a very clear argument. The spiritual argument is a little bit more dangerous.

Jesse Rosen: Well, it is, and our vice president for government affairs recently told me she was speaking with the head of an organization called the Independent Sector, which is the umbrella of all nonprofits in America. And the League, along with all the nonprofits, have been lobbying very hard around any threats to the incentive for people to make tax-deductible contributions, which is part of the Obama Administration's proposal, or it had been until just a couple of days ago. And so there's been a big mobilizing effort around this to ensure that our sector remains secure.

> But the head of Independent Sector, as Heather tells it -- she took her finger and stuck it right in her chest and said you can't keep talking about how beautiful the music is. It's not going to change anybody's mind. And I think from a policy standpoint this is the -you know, a challenge for us because, frankly, we do believe the music is beautiful and we do believe it has redeeming social value. And somebody -- a researcher two years ago did a study of what people actually experience when they're in a symphony orchestra concert, and he came up with six categories of experience.

> And one of them had to do with intellectual stimulation, another had to do with a sense of group identity, another one had spirituality, another one a sense of community, another one had to

do with just generally a social sense, being part of something with other people. So, you know, I don't know if that's the answer, but I think it's a piece of the answer, that we need people in our society to be stimulated, to experience beauty, to also have experiences that are -- and this is unique to our art form -- that can't fit into words. The inexpressible, which taps into parts of who we are.

And, on some level, that has to be a good thing for the American citizenry. I think it's not sufficient, and I think the -- part of our arguments have to include facts like, of the 32,000 concerts given by American orchestras every year, half of those are education concerts. And probably -- I don't know what the percentage is -- but a high proportion are given in inner-city neighborhoods. And the whole scope of civic engagement activity, where there's a whole public service dimension to the work of orchestras, is beginning to grow and consume more resource.

And I think the economic impact argument has some value, but it's not a distinctive one, and it's one any sector can make. And there are sectors who can argue much greater economic impact than the orchestra field. So I think our challenge is to, you know, hang on to what is uniquely orchestra, that nobody else can do, that no other art form can do, and at the same time be very cognizant of the need to continue to grow the service we provide to communities and tell that story to our policymakers. Mark Clague: Yeah, I mean, one of the examples maybe of the spiritual contribution that an orchestra can make to, I know, at least my life is with one of your local composers, John Adams, here in San Francisco who wrote Transmigration of Souls. And, you know, which was a response to the 9/11 tragedy. And his courage to take on, in a very fresh way, because that was written in 2002, just less -- you know, only really a few months after the attack had happened, but his ability to take that event, which powerfully changed all of our lives, and to give it some kind of emotional, you know, environment in which we could experience those feelings was so powerful for me -- and I know a lot of communities, because of the 10th anniversary, have been performing that piece -- but that's, I think, a great example of the power of music to serve.

Jesse Rosen: You know, I would even take it further than that, in the experience of the Louisiana Philharmonic after Hurricane Katrina. The very first public event where the community could come out and be together was a concert of the Louisiana Philharmonic. And I had a meeting with their orchestra committee, the group who negotiates their contract and represents them, about a month before they were about to move back into their concert hall. And so I asked them, you know, how it felt to be for four years without a concert hall because their hall was underwater.

> And they said some really interesting things. They said they actually got better -- they played better as a result. I said how could this be? And they said, well, you know, when we couldn't hear each

other because the acoustics were so bad, you know, we watched each other more closely, and, when we couldn't see each other, we listened more closely. And so the adversity of the environments actually made us get better. And then what they said, that really struck me, was that we were actually able to see people's faces while we were playing, because we were in community centers and churches.

And we could see the impact of what it was our music making was having on the people in front of us. And that inspired us and made us play better. And so, you know, for me, I always see this as the marriage of, you know, two very important ideas about service to community and also the intrinsic value of the art, itself, and the impact that it has. And, not surprisingly, the first capital expenditure in New Orleans after Katrina hit was to restore the concert hall. I mean, that orchestra made itself a part of the healing of that city, and they did it through being close to people. But they were playing the standard, traditional orchestral repertoire.

Mark Clague: You know, it strikes me that a lot of this discussion of spirituality - I mean, in the 19th century we would've thought of the church as being this place that provided this sort of human dimension, this meaning to community, and made us think about sort of these larger issues. Do you think there's some parallels between the sort of late 19th century, between our communities getting, you know, the urban community, in particular, getting larger and larger and maybe

religion no longer bringing people together? And then culture being a way [that's just] filled that void?

Neil Harris: I think culture -- remember, there were a whole series of great pronouncements on culture in the 19th century -- John Reskin and William Morris and so on, some in music, some in the arts. Yeah, so I think culture is a religion to many people, and these were temples -- they were literally, in the case of the museums, temple like in their construction, and you were meant to approach as a worshiper. This produced, of course, on the part of some institutions a degree of condescension, which they've been trying to live down in the decades ever since because, again, you have priests and then you have a congregation.

> And the kind of natural, easy connections between the art form and the larger public are diminished as a result of that. But, you know, there's no question that this became a unifying device for local communities everywhere, to have, again, as I said at the start, an orchestra or a museum or a choral society, a dance company, a theatre company, these were badges of community and connection. Speaking of the spirituality, I wonder, since I'm not a specialist on orchestra, if you would care to comment on the fact that some orchestra conductors used to face the audience when they conducted, their backs to the orchestra, so that the audience could share in their --

Mark Clague: [Can we] take a vote --

Neil Harris: [Do you want to see the conductor?] There was a kind of celebrity aspect to this, but, nevertheless, I think it was designed to elicit reactions and responses which you can't really get when you see the back of the conductor, as easily, although Sousa used to be the subject of Vaudeville acts just because of his back gestures. And he had his imitators as a result of that.

Mark Clague: Well, that's one of the fun things -- I think actually the first concert I heard in Davies was -- I was sitting right back there in these choir, you know, seats, and it is a fascinating thing. I mean, both Neil and I are bassoonists -- you play the trombone, is that right?

Neil Harris: [Trombone, yeah.]

Mark Clague: So we -- I sort of grew up looking at the conductor from the front.
And that is a really important aspect, that the conductors motions, which, you know, the conductor doesn't make a sound, right, and shouldn't make a sound, but, you know, I certainly find myself watching the conductor. And there's a kind of -- the conductor sort of offers an interpretation, focuses our attention -- not only the musicians -- on what's important -- but for those of us in the audience watching to see what's important. So I think it is a nice thing. The only problem I have with these seats is the French horns are rather loud since they -- so it does change the balance a little bit. I don't know, Jesse, do you want to comment on that?

Jesse Rosen: I've seen conductors turn around to the audience several times recently, and one of the occasions was to lead the entire audience in singing Simple Gifts, the shaker hymn from Appalachian Spring, as a prelude to the formal performance of it. And I thought that was sensational. I mean, I think singing in concerts is really -- is just a great thing to do. I mean, not all the time, but that was a wonderful, organic way for a conductor to turn and face the audience. So --

Mark Clague: But those -- I mean, certainly in the history of this orchestra, with Henry Hadley or Alfred Hertz or others, there -- these big personalities have often been the window, the connection between the relatively anonymous musicians who are [just] the orchestra and the public.

Neil Harris: Yes, they're the Willy Mays.

Mark Clague: I want to give you the chance to meet one of your musicians. Amos
Yang is on our second spotlight panel, along with Afa Dworkin.
And they will be talking, I think, about education and about
community, about access, which is another big issue -- who do we
have connecting with our orchestras? And so we're going to take a
little bit of pause here and go offstage and join you in the audience
and welcome our next spotlight panel, but thanks so much for being
part of this conversation, so far.

Neil Harris: Thank you.